

# Public Document Pack



## Agenda Supplement

Dear Councillor

### **PLANNING COMMITTEE - TUESDAY, 23RD JULY, 2024**

I am now able to enclose, for consideration at next Tuesday, 23rd July, 2024 meeting of the Planning Committee, the following reports that were unavailable when the agenda was printed.

<b>Agenda No</b>	<b>Item</b>
------------------	-------------

3.	<b><u>Minutes of the Previous Meeting</u> (Pages 3 - 12)</b>
----	--

Report of FIELD\_AUTHOR

Yours sincerely

Jonathan Stephenson  
Chief Executive

Encs





## Minutes

---

### **Planning Committee** **Tuesday, 9th July, 2024**

#### **Membership/Attendance**

Cllr Mynott (Chair)  
Cllr M Cuthbert (Vice-Chair)  
Cllr Baldock  
Cllr Barber  
Cllr Dr Barrett  
Cllr Mrs N Cuthbert

Cllr Gelderbloem  
Cllr Gorton  
Cllr Naylor  
Cllr Patel  
Cllr Sunger

#### **Substitute Present**

#### **Also Present**

Cllr S Cloke  
Cllr Jerrard  
Cllr Parker  
Cllr Mrs Pound  
Cllr Russell  
Cllr Wagland  
Cllr Worsfold  
Cllr Lockhart

#### **Officers Present**

Emma Goodings	- Director of Place
Claire Mayhew	- Acting Joint Director of People & Governance & Monitoring Officer
Zoe Borman	- Governance and Member Support Officer
Caroline Corrigan	- Corporate Manager (Planning Development Management)
Brooke Pride	- Planning Officer
Steven Bell	- Solicitor, Birketts (for and on behalf of the Council's Solicitor)
David Carter	- Environmental Health Manager
Brendan Johnston	- Strategic Development Engineer, Essex Highways

## **LIVE BROADCAST**

[Live broadcast will commence at 7.00pm and available for repeated viewing.](#)

### **52. Apologies for Absence**

Apologies were received from Cllrs Laplain and McCheyne. Cllrs Barrett and Mrs Marsh were substituting.

### **53. Minutes of the Previous Meeting**

The Minutes of the Planning Committee held on 12<sup>th</sup> March 2024 were agreed as a true record.

### **54. APPLICATION NO: 23/01502/FUL LAND AT BEGGAR HILL BEGGAR HILL FRYERNING ESSEX**

This item was deferred prior to the Committee.

Officers had received lengthy representations late in the application process, and after the publication of the committee report, which raised a number of questions. Officers were of the view that further details are required from the applicant and comments from consultees in order for these matters to be addressed. The Legal team have advised that this is a sensible course.

### **55. APPLICATION NO: 23/01503/FUL LAND AT BEGGAR HILL BEGGAR HILL FRYERNING ESSEX**

This item was deferred prior to the Committee.

Officers had received lengthy representations late in the application process, and after the publication of the committee report, which raised a number of questions. Officers were of the view that further details are required from the applicant and comments from consultees in order for these matters to be addressed. The Legal team have advised that this is a sensible course.

### **56. APPLICATION NO: 23/01504/FUL LAND AT BEGGAR HILL BEGGAR HILL FRYERNING ESSEX**

This item was deferred prior to the Committee.

Officers had received lengthy representations late in the application process, and after the publication of the committee report, which raised a number of

questions. Officers were of the view that further details are required from the applicant and comments from consultees in order for these matters to be addressed. The Legal team have advised that this is a sensible course.

The Chair advised the Committee he was varying the order of the Agenda to enable Application No: 23/01159/OUT and Application No: 23/01164/FUL Land North of Shenfield, Alexander Lane, Shenfield to be heard before Application No: 23/01607/FUL 2 Weald Road, Brentwood Essex.

**57. APPLICATION NO: 23/01505/FUL LAND AT BEGGAR HILL BEGGAR HILL FRYERNING ESSEX**

This item was deferred prior to the Committee.

Officers had received lengthy representations late in the application process, and after the publication of the committee report, which raised a number of questions. Officers were of the view that further details are required from the applicant and comments from consultees in order for these matters to be addressed. The Legal team have advised that this is a sensible course.

The Chair advised the Committee he was varying the order of the Agenda to enable Application No: 23/01159/OUT and Application No: 23/01164/FUL Land North of Shenfield, Alexander Lane, Shenfield to be heard before Application No: 23/01607/FUL 2 Weald Road, Brentwood Essex.

**58. APPLICATION NO: 23/01164/FUL LAND NORTH OF SHENFIELD ALEXANDER LANE SHENFIELD ESSEX**

The Chair took the decision for this application and the following application to be presented and debated together. However, a separate vote was taken on each application.

Ms Kathryn Williams presented the reports.

Mr Roche, resident, addressed the Committee objecting to the application. Ms Lynch also spoke as an objector on behalf of Oliver Road residents.

The committee then heard from Mr Andersen as a resident objector. Also Mr Baines addressed the Committee objecting on behalf of Chelmsford Road residents.

The Committee then heard from Ms Piper in support of both applications, on behalf of the Applicant.

Cllr Worsfold, Ward Cllr, was present and raised his concerns regarding both sites including the absence of a school drop off zone, road safety, road

closures and travel issues, the lack of care home or community centre and flooding.

Ward Cllr Gordon, who was not present, had his statement read out. His concerns included the increase in traffic and negative impact on residents of Oliver Road and Alexander Lane.

Cllr Aspinell also spoke as County Councillor agreeing with residents and members on the local issues such as drainage and highways.

Members raised concerns regarding the flood risk, and was advised by officers that the Environment Agency had been consulted on the application.

Affordable housing was another issue raised by Members and how the 35% allocation mix was derived. Officers advised the demand from the Council's housing service had been met and they had worked hard with developers offer policy compliant affordability.

Members raised concerns about the availability of major documents and the uploading of late documentation which prevented them from making an informed decision.

Following a full discussion a motion to **DEFER** was **MOVED** by Cllr Barber and **SECONDED** by Cllr Mynott.

This motion was subsequently withdrawn.

Following discussion, the meeting was adjourned for a short period of time for officers to gather highways data requested by members.

Mr Johnstone, from Essex Highways, was present at the meeting to advise members on technical issues. Data supporting the reasons for no drop off zone was presented.

Concerns were raised by Members regarding the three-storey designs of some of the homes on the proposed development and whether they were policy compliant.

Cllr Mynott **MOVED** a motion to **DEFER** the application. This was **SECONDED** by Cllr Cuthbert.

A vote was taken and Members voted as follows:

FOR: Cllrs Mynott, M Cuthbert, Gorton (3)

AGAINST: Cllrs Dr Barrett, Barber, Mrs Gelderbloem, Barrett, Marsh, Naylor, Patel, Sunger (8)

ABSTAIN: Cllrs Mrs N Cuthbert, Baldock (2)

The motion to **DEFER** was **LOST**.

A motion to **REFUSE** the application was **MOVED** by Cllr Mrs Marsh and **SECONDED** by Cllr Naylor.

FOR: Cllrs M Cuthbert, Dr Barrett, Mrs N Cuthbert, Baldock, Barber, Mrs Gelderbloem, Barrett, Mrs Marsh, Naylor, Patel, Sunger (11)

AGAINST: (0)

ABSTAIN: Cllrs Mynott, Gorton (2)

The motion to **REFUSE** the application was **APPROVED**.

The application was **REFUSED** for the following reasons:

As per the Council's Constitution, the final wording of reasons are to be delegated to officers in consultation with the chair and vice chair.

[Cllr Mynott declared a non-pecuniary interest as a Member of Essex Wildlife Trust]

**59. APPLICATION NO: 23/01159/OUT LAND NORTH OF SHENFIELD ALEXANDER LANE SHENFIELD ESSEX**

The Chair took the decision for this application and the following application to be presented and debated together. However, a separate vote was taken on each application.

Ms Katharine Williams presented the reports.

Mr Roche, resident, addressed the Committee objecting to the application. Ms Lynch also spoke as an objector on behalf of Oliver Road residents.

The committee then heard from Mr Andersen as a resident objector. Also Mr Baines addressed the Committee objecting on behalf of Chelmsford Road residents.

The Committee then heard from Ms Piper in support of both applications, on behalf of the Applicant.

Cllr Worsfold, Ward Cllr, was present and raised his concerns regarding both sites including the absence of a school drop off zone, road safety, road closures and travel issues, the lack of care home or community centre and flooding.

Ward Cllr Gordon, who was not present, had his statement read out. His concerns included the increase in traffic and negative impact on residents of Oliver Road and Alexander Lane.

Cllr Aspinell also spoke as County Councillor agreeing with residents and members on the local issues such as drainage and highways.

Following a full discussion a **MOTION** to **APPROVE** the application was **MOVED** by Cllr Barrett and **SECONDED** by Cllr Mynott.

Members voted as followed:

FOR: Cllrs Mynott, M Cuthbert, Dr Barrett, Mrs N Cuthbert, Baldock, Barber, Mrs Gelderbloem, Gorton, Barrett, Mrs Marsh, Naylor, Patel, Sunger. (13)

AGAINST (0)

Abstain: (0)

The **MOTION** to **APPROVE** the application was **RESOLVED** subject to conditions outlined in the report.

[Cllr Mynott declared a non-pecuniary interest as a Member of Essex Wildlife Trust]

**60. APPLICATION NO: 23/01607/FUL 2 WEALD ROAD BRENTWOOD ESSEX CM14 4SX**

The application has been referred at the request of Cllr D Naylor for the following reason:

Elevation and stepping down, Character of Landscape

The existing elevation is currently 3 storeys at 10.020. The proposed elevation is 4 storeys at 12.820, nearly double the height of the 2 story Victorian and 1970's houses.

The current height of buildings on Weald Road descends from Umyia House with 6 floors, 4 for 01 Weald Road Leigh House, then 3 floors for the current 02 Weald Road, thereafter 2 storey houses the full length of the road. The new application still goes against this landscape, setting another new precedence of going higher and higher out of all context with the current landscape and general area.

Page 18 of the Design and Access Statement 1042411 states that new application keeps the "stepping down" visual transition, however this is not the case. The current building steps down from 3 to 2, an additional floor is nearly double the height of the terraced houses.



Page 17 of the Design and Access Statement 1042411 states that the reduction of the additional floor from the first application is in keeping with the character of the street, this is false. The character of the majority of the street is Housing of 2 floors. The Weald Road part by the High Street with the ever increasing height of buildings is a very recent phenomenon and is out of keeping with the rest of Weald Road and the general urban area.

#### References

- Page 13 of the Design and Access Statement 1042411 references The Replacement Local Plan, which as far as I'm aware is a Local Plan adopted in 1995, and has been superseded by 2 other Local Plans.

#### Need for the Development

- Number of Flats already in the area, many of which are unsold for a significant duration of time showing that there is no need for more of these apartments to be built in this area.

#### Parking and Access issues

##### POLICY BE13: PARKING STANDARDS

5.111 G. adequate provision should be made for efficient deliveries and servicing.

- No provision is made for this point in the current plan. How will work people and deliveries service these dwellings?
- Refuse collection is quite a distance from access points, there's a current long-standing issue of Refuse blocking the alleyway because Private Refuse collectors for the commercial unit insist on direct road side collection.

##### STRATEGIC POLICY BE14: CREATING SUCCESSFUL PLACES

k. sensitively integrate parking places and functional needs for storage, refuse and recycling collection points;

- There is none at the front, and rear access is reliant on a narrow road of the public highway that has fully utilised permit parking spaces all along one side and double yellow lines elsewhere.

#### Impact on existing residents

##### STRATEGIC POLICY BE14: CREATING SUCCESSFUL PLACES

j. safeguard the living conditions of future occupants of the development and adjacent residents;

- There's no comment as to how the proposed application will mitigate the impact on existing and surrounding residents, for example noise from the commercial unit or any air conditioning and heating units for the dwellings.

Ms Brooke Pride presented the report.

The Committee heard from the Agent, Alessandro, in support of the application.

Ward Cllr Cloke was present at the meeting and spoke objecting to the application for reasons including overbearing, unacceptable bin store position, and parking.

Cllr Naylor reiterated his reasons for referral and refrained from voting,

Following a full debate Members were minded to agree with Cllr Naylor with its overbearing, bulk and massing and contradiction to the Town Centre Design Guide.

A **MOTION** to **REFUSE** the application was **MOVED** by Cllr Mynott and **SECONDED** by Cllr Barber.

A vote was taken and Members voted as follows:

FOR: Cllrs Mynott, M Cuthbert, Dr Barrett, Mrs N Cuthbert, Baldock, Barber, Mrs Gelderbloem, Gorton, Barrett, Mrs Marsh, Patel, Sunger (12)

AGAINST (0)

ABSTAIN: (0)

The MOTION to **REFUSE** the application was **RESOLVED** for the following reasons:

As per the Council's Constitution, the final wording of reasons are to be delegated to officers in consultation with the chair and vice chair.

## 61. Urgent Business

Plots 1 – 6 Land South of Horseman Side, Navestock. Planning Application Nos: 23/01114/FUL, 23/01115/FUL, 23/01116/FUL, 23/01117/FUL, 23/01118/FUL, 23/01119/FUL - EXEMPT

There was 1 item of urgent business.

The Chair **MOVED** that any public be excluded from the meeting for the following item as the report or the debate is confidential by virtue of the likely disclosure of information exempt under para. 1 and 3 of Part 1 to Schedule 12A to the Local Government Act 1972, namely information in respect of which a claim to legal professional privilege could be maintained in legal proceedings.

A motion was **MOVED** by Cllr Dr Barrett and **SECONDED** by Cllr Naylor to **REFUSE** the recommendations in the report.

A vote was taken and this was **RESOLVED UNANIMOUSLY**.

The meeting concluded at 12:16 am

This page is intentionally left blank